

# President's Taskforce on Sexual Harassment

Dr. Natalie Eddington Dr. Susan Buskirk Chairs

Stephanie Suerth, Coordinator

November 8, 2019

# **Executive Summary**

University of Maryland, Baltimore (UMB) enrolls "over 6,700 students in six nationally ranked professional schools — dentistry, law, medicine, nursing, pharmacy, and social work — and an interdisciplinary Graduate School. The University offers 62 doctoral, master's, baccalaureate, and certificate programs and confers most of the professional practice doctoral degrees awarded in Maryland".<sup>1</sup> UMB has seven Core Values, representing the seven Schools that make up UMB, which guides its programs and activities. The Core Values are Accountability, Civility, Collaboration, Diversity, Excellence, Knowledge, and Leadership. UMB further relies upon four pillars of professionalism, which are Civility, Accountability, Transparency, and Efficiency.

UMB is committed to providing a learning and working environment that is free from Sexual Misconduct, specifically sex and gender-based harassment. At a quarterly Q&A Session hosted by President Perman, members of the UMB community communicated concerns and asserted that UMB has not fulfilled its obligations in protecting its community from sexual harassment. In response to those concerns, President Perman formed a taskforce to examine sexual harassment and prevention efforts. The President's Taskforce on Sexual Harassment was charged with assessing UMB's capacity to respond effectively to incidents of sexual harassment and sexual misconduct; identify and prioritize areas of needed improvement; recommend actions and interventions that will promote a culture of respect, civility, and safety; and recommend an accountability and monitoring framework that can be used to evaluate our ongoing performance as it relates to Title IX education and compliance.

Between April and September 2019, the Taskforce and subcommittees evaluated policy/procedures, education/training, communication, analytics/climate, accountability, and resources components of UMB's overall program for responding to claims of sexual harassment. This Report provides a summary of the activities of the Taskforce, recommendations offered to the President, and an Action Plan to provide for the implementation of the recommendations.

Representatives from the President's Taskforce on Sexual Harassment were appointed to the President's Council for Women to provide continuity and ongoing dialogue regarding the impact of sexual harassment on women.

## Challenges

The need to address sexual harassment on campus presents many challenges. The first is the diversity of stakeholders. The diversity of the UMB community, including the diversity of experiences and expectations within the UMB community, allows for differing expectations from UMB regarding its efforts to prevent and respond to sexual harassment.

Another challenge is decentralization. The unique nature of UMB presents challenges in identifying commonalities and looking for best practices across the Schools, while still providing recommendations that are designed to benefit the University as a whole.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> University of Maryland, Baltimore. (No Date). Fast Facts. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.umaryland.edu/about-umb/umb-fast-facts/</u>

A final challenge was the scope of the charge, the need to quickly and effectively look for recommendations that would begin to turn the curve and contribute to a cultural change regarding the issue of sexual harassment.

### Process

Between April and August 2019, in addition to task force meetings, sub-committee members met and worked independently from the task force to promote objectivity in their reviews. Further, members were free to use their own judgement and adapt their processes as needed to obtain an accurate and complete assessment of their assigned component. They then presented a formal report to the entire task force that described their assessment of the component's current status, the process and evidence used to conduct the assessment, identified areas of insufficiency or gaps, and recommendations for addressing those areas.

## **Decision Criteria**

Based on the diversity of stakeholders and interested parties, their priorities and expectations, and the responsibility of the UMB, the following criteria were determined for review of the potential solutions for adoption and implementation:

- Does the solution create consistency and maximize consensus;
- Does the solution minimize risk through prevention;
- Does the solution maximize impact through scope; and
- Does the solution maximize community buy in through transparency?

#### Recommendations

Each of the Taskforce subcommittees identified gaps and made recommendation based on their efforts. An examination of the subcommittee groups provided common theme recommendations. These included:

- 1. Implement a comprehensive cultural transformation initiative
- 2. Increase transparency relating to sexual harassment reporting, follow up, and outcomes
- 3. Provide more education and training opportunities (including diversity of education modes blended learning)
- 4. Increase awareness in UMB community relating to sexual harassment and related issues, including reporting mechanisms and outcomes.
- 5. Increase resources for OAC/Title IX Office (in addition to two positions approved for FY20)
- 6. Centralize and streamline policies, processes, and management of sexual harassment cases to create consistency

Based on the common theme recommendations, the Taskforce prepared an Action Plan that included implementation activities, timelines, recommended resources, and desired outcomes.

# Table of Contents

utive Summary	ii
Introduction	5
Challenges	6
Process	7
Decision-Making Criteria 1	0
Recommendations	10
Implementation 1	11
Strategic Goal 1	1
Audience / Stakeholders 1	11
Action Plan 1	2
Budget1	17
Summary & Conclusion 1	17
	Introduction Challenges Process Decision-Making Criteria

## I. Introduction

In the Fall of 2018, the Baltimore Sun published an article that detailed allegations of sexual harassment and subsequent actions by the University of Maryland, School of Medicine (SOM). In response, the SOM launched a Program in Cultural Transformation designed to "transform UMSOM's culture into a national model for a respectful, inclusive, and professional work environment."<sup>2</sup> Concurrently, President Jay Perman, M.D. initiated discussions relating to sexual harassment at the campus level, standing on the fundamental core values of accountability and civility. In January 2019, Dr. Perman made Title IX compliance and sexual harassment the focus of his quarterly Q&A. He stated "The matter of mistreatment, sexual harassment, and concerns about retaliation all relate to civility and accountability."<sup>3</sup> Over one hundred (100) faculty, staff, and students attended to provide feedback, ask questions, and voice their concerns around the topic of sexual harassment. Attendees purported that the "University has fallen short in creating a harassment-free environment and responding to sexual harassment claims."<sup>4</sup>

UMB's efforts come in the wake of the national #MeToo movement and the release of a Report by the National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine entitled *Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine*<sup>5</sup> which determined that sexual harassment is a serious and ongoing issue for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Morrison, J. (December 3, 2018). *School of Medicine Launches Cultural Transformation*. Retrieved from: https://www.umaryland.edu/news/archived-news/december-2018/newspressreleaseshottopics/school-of-medicinelaunches-cultural-transformation.php)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> No Author. (January 23, 2019). *President's Q&A, January 2019*). Retrieved from: <u>https://www.umaryland.edu/president/q-and-a-with-the-president/qa-archives/january-2019.php</u> <sup>4</sup> *Id*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine 2018. *Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. <u>https://doi.org/10.17226/24994</u>

women in academic science, engineering, and medicine, which is dependent, in large part, on the organizational climate of the institution.

To address the issue of sexual harassment and the organizational climate that can permit its occurrence, Dr. Perman announced that he would "form a task force to strengthen the University's anti-harassment policies and practices as well as create a permanent committee to advise him on women's issues."<sup>6</sup>

## II. Challenges

The issue of sexual harassment is a complex and complicated one. Nonetheless, the President, and the UMB community, require immediate and swift attention to the issue to address its occurrence and lessen its impact. Due to this immediacy, a challenge identified was the scope of the issue and the time needed to be thorough and effective.

Another challenge is the diversity of the stakeholders. All members of the UMB community, as well as visitors to the campus, externship and external partners, and the University of Maryland Medical Center have an interest in the efforts to prevent and respond to sexual harassment. That diversity is compounded by the differing generations, cultures, and personal experiences within the UMB community.

Another challenge identified is based on the structure of UMB, a hybrid of centralization and decentralization. Shared governance and independence, while a strength of the organization, can also present challenges in creating consistency and ensuring equity for any persons impacted, both as a complainant and as a respondent, by sexual harassment.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> No Author. (January 23, 2019). *President's Q&A, January 2019*). Retrieved from: <u>https://www.umaryland.edu/president/q-and-a-with-the-president/qa-archives/january-2019.php</u>.

#### III. Process

Between January and March 2019, through ongoing meetings between UMB's Executive Leaders and various stakeholder groups, guidance was provided for the creation of the President's Taskforce on Sexual Harassment. President Perman then issued letters of invitation to representatives from all seven Schools, as well as UMB administration. Additionally, the three senates, Faculty, Staff, and Student, were requested to appoint a representative to the Taskforce. The Taskforce included members of the faculty, staff, and student body. It was Chaired by Dr. Natalie Eddington, Dean, School of Pharmacy, and Dr. Susan Buskirk, AVP and Deputy Accountability Officer. Stephanie Suerth, Program Director, served as coordinator. The members of the Taskforce include:

- > Patty Alvarez, PhD, assistant vice president for student affairs
- > Toni Antalis, MD, professor of physiology, School of Medicine
- Vineet Dhar, BDS, MDS, PhD, clinical associate professor and interim chair, Department of Orthodontics and Pediatric Dentistry, School of Dentistry
- Eryn Dixon, secretary, Graduate Student Association
- > Leigh Goodmark, JD, professor of law, Carey School of Law
- Matt Lasecki, SPHR, associate vice president, Human Resource Services
- Ann Mech, JD, RN, director of legal affairs, School of Nursing
- Megan Meyer, PhD, MSW, associate dean for academic affairs, School of Social Work
- Russell McClain, JD, associate professor of law and associate dean for diversity and inclusion, Carey School of Law
- > Tricia O'Neill, JD, assistant vice president for academic affairs
- Susan Wolfsthal, MD, professor of medicine and associate chair for education, School of Medicine; residency program director, University of Maryland Medical Center

- Representing the University senates are the following members:
- Faculty Senate: Deborah Eisenberg, JD, professor of law and director, Center for Dispute Resolution, Carey School of Law
- Staff Senate: Rachel Beaudry, MSW, senior program specialist, Institute for Innovation and Implementation, School of Social Work
- Staff Senate: Gregory Brightbill, academic coordinator, Office of Academic Affairs<sup>7</sup>

Dr. Perman charged his taskforce "to assess our capacity to respond effectively to incidents of sexual harassment and sexual misconduct; identify and prioritize areas of needed improvement; recommend actions and interventions that will promote a culture of respect, civility, and safety; and recommend an accountability and monitoring framework that can be used to evaluate our ongoing performance as it relates to Title IX education and compliance."

In April 2019, the Taskforce convened for its inaugural meeting and established a working timeline for carrying out the President's directive. Mikhel Kushner, UMB's Title IX Coordinator attended initial Taskforce meetings to provide information regarding UMB's Title IX program generally and its process for responding to allegation of sexual harassment at UMB specifically. Ms. Kushner also make herself available to each member of the Taskforce for individual meetings or to provide additional information regarding the program and processes upon their request. Sub-committees were created to review various components of UMB's Title IX program, policies and processes relevant to responding to allegations of sexual harassment.

Sub-committee members were tasked with determining the component's current status, identify existing gaps or deficiencies, generating ideas for improvement, and making

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Ms. Beaudry left the Taskforce and Mr. Brightbill was then appointed to the Taskforce by the Staff Senate.

recommendations for actions designed to strengthen and improve UMB's response to sexual

harassment.

Specific sub-committees and their membership were as follows:

- Accountability: Ann Mech and Megan Meyer
- Climate and Analytics: Vineet Dhar and Nivedita Hegdekar
- Communication: Leigh Goodmark and Nicole Hayes
- Education and Training: Tony Antalis and Susan Wolfsthal
- Legal Sufficiency (Policy and Procedure Review): Deborah Eisenberg and Matt Lasecki
- Resources: Patricia Alvarez and Russell McClain

To assist the subcommittees and create consistency, materials were provided, including

but not limited to:

- Resources through a shared Teams Site specific to the area being assessed;
- Outline for Program Evaluation based on the 2011 CDC Developing an Effective Evaluation Plan; and
- Template for Subcommittee Reports.

Additional resources provided to the Taskforce included a report by an independent

review of the Title IX operations by an external consultant.

The full Taskforce met five (5) times between April and September 2019, with an additional six (6) meetings of the Chairs and subcommittees. Between April and August 2019, in addition to the group meetings, sub-committee members met and worked independently to promote objectivity in their reviews.

Further, members were free to use their own judgement and adapt their processes as needed to obtain an accurate and complete assessment of their assigned component. Throughout the review, each subcommittee used the data specific to their component. This was inclusive, but not limited to, aggregate data regarding reports from UMB's EthicsPoint system which is informed by the UMB Hotline and subsequent responses to allegations, the applicable federal and state regulations regarding discrimination and sexual harassment, independent interviews with experts and stakeholders, and reviews of central and School specific websites.

The subcommittees then presented a formal report to the Taskforce that described their assessment of the component's current status, the process and evidence used to conduct the assessment, identified areas of insufficiency or gaps, and recommendations for addressing those areas.

# IV. Decision-Making Criteria

Throughout the Taskforce's efforts and discussions, challenges and recommendations

were reviewed in consideration of:

- Does the solution create consistency and maximize consensus;
- Does the solution minimize risk through prevention;
- Does the solution maximize impact through scope; and
- Does the solution maximize community buy in through transparency?

## V. Recommendations

On September 11, 2019, the Chairs of the Taskforce, Drs. Eddington and Buskirk, met

with President Perman to brief him on the Taskforce's activities and recommendations arising

from the collective work of the Taskforce and the subcommittee assessments. During that

briefing, the Chairs provided that the Taskforce had identified common themes throughout the

process that were offered as recommendations to improve UMB's prevention of and response to

instances of sexual harassment.

The common themes identified were:

- 1. Implement a comprehensive cultural transformation initiative
- 2. Increase transparency relating to sexual harassment reporting, follow up, and outcomes
- 3. Provide more education and training opportunities (including diversity of education modes blended learning)
- 4. Increase awareness in UMB community relating to sexual harassment and related issues, including reporting mechanisms and outcomes.

- 5. Increase resources for OAC/Title IX Office (in addition to two positions approved for FY20)
- 6. Centralize and streamline policies, processes, and management of sexual harassment cases to create consistency

With each recommendation collectively contributing to a cultural transformation, the recommended actions were inclusive of the common themes as follows:

Recommendation 1 (Common Theme #6): Create standards for UMB's prevention and response activities to sexual harassment within its community that are consistent through policies, procedures, and application.

Recommendation 2 (Common Themes #3, 4, and 5): Additional resources for responding

to allegation of misconduct, as well as support awareness and training initiatives across UMB.

Recommendation 3 (Common Themes #2 and 4): Build trust and understanding within

the UMB community through increased transparency on reporting misconduct, the investigatory process, and outcomes.

Recommendation 4 (Common Themes #3 and 4): Increase awareness of UMB processes, trainings, and resources for members of the community impacted by sexual harassment.

## VI. Implementation

#### Strategic Goal

Improve UMB's prevention efforts and response to sexual harassment, creating a professional and educational environment that is civil and equitable.

#### Audience / Stakeholders

The Taskforce identified the audience and stakeholders for the issue to be universal. UMB has an obligation to all members of its community, faculty, staff, and students, to create an environment that is free from sexual harassment. It further has an obligation to University Systems of Maryland and the citizens of the State as a public institution to protect against loss of prestige and fiscal sanctions. The complex and far reaching effect of UMB's efforts will require high level of stakeholder and audience acceptance.

## Action Plan

Based on the common theme recommendations, the Taskforce prepared an Action Plan that included implementation activities, timelines, recommended resources, and desired outcomes.

## TASK FORCE ON SEXUAL HARASSMENT RECOMMENDATIONS ACTION PLAN

# **RECOMMENDATION** 1

Create standards for UMB's prevention and response activities to sexual harassment within its community that are consistent through policies, procedures, and application.

ACTION STEP DESCRIPTIONS	PARTY / DEPT RESPONSIBLE	START DATE	DATE DUE	RESOURCES REQUIRED	DESIRED OUTCOME	NOTES
Update policies addressing sexual harassment and misconduct	Title IX Office Office of Accountability and Compliance	8/12/2019	2/1/2020	OAC existing personnel will continue drafting /revising policy and accompanying procedures	Bring UMB's policies into alignment with legal requirements, USM policies, and best practices.	A draft policy has been prepared and provided to Legal for review that was written to bring UMB into compliance with Md. Ed. Code Ann. 11-601 and USM's policy. Taskforce sub-group reviewed for legal sufficiency. Additional procedures and policies will be developed upon receipt of feedback/approval.
Create policy addressing retaliation	Office of Accountability and Compliance	10/1/2019	6/1/2020	OAC existing personnel will draft/revise policies (no additional costs)	Increase in trust More reports of misconduct / less anonymous reporting	Retaliation for speaking up regarding sexual harassment is a real and ongoing concern, a policy to iterate UMB's commitment to protecting member of the community that report misconduct will increase trust.

14 | P a g e

RECOMMENDATION 2							
Additional resources for responding to allegation of misconduct, as well as support awareness and training initiatives across UMB.							
ACTION STEP DESCRIPTIONS	PARTY / DEPT RESPONSIBLE	START DATE	DATE DUE	RESOURCES REQUIRED	DESIRED OUTCOME	NOTES	
Additional Compliance Specialists (x2) Reorganized Title IX Coordinator Position	Office of Accountability and Compliance	1/1/2020	7/1/2020	Two (2) FTE positions @ \$75,000 each for a total of \$150,000 annually One (1) FTE Title IX Coordinator @ \$150,000 annually	Increase the number of persons implementing prevention strategies and awareness activities Decrease the time for investigations into allegations of sexual harassment through additional resources	See examination of staffing structures at sister and identified organizations.	
UMB Advocates	Office of Accountability and Compliance	2/1/2020	6/30/2020	Training curriculum and development approximately \$ 6000 - 10,000 Time commitment from advocate volunteers (no additional cost)	Create a corps of Advocates trained in trauma-informed response, educated regarding local victim resources, and aware of UMB policy to act as advocates for persons impacted by sexual harassment.	This aligns with best practices and the UMB Advocates could be encouraged to create relationships with the professional advocates embedded at BPD, Mercy Medical Center, and House of Ruth to allow for continuity of care.	

## **RECOMMENDATION 3**

Build trust and understanding within the UMB community through increased transparency on reporting misconduct, the investigatory process, and outcomes.

ACTION STEP DESCRIPTIONS	PARTY / DEPT RESPONSIBLE	START DATE	DATE DUE	RESOURCES REQUIRED	DESIRED OUTCOME	NOTES
Publish Sexual Harassment/ Misconduct Statistics and Outcomes	Office of Accountability and Compliance	12/1/2019	2/1/2020	IT page development (no additional cost) Maintenance of site (no additional cost) Ongoing updating of information (no additional costs)	While protecting privacy, publishing the outcomes of sexual harassment complaints demonstrates UMB's commitment to responding/ending sexual harassment.	Transparency efforts would begin with aggregate, de- identified reports regarding allegations, investigations, and outcomes, increasing the transparency toward the example of Yale's Reports (https://provost.yale.edu/title- ix/reports ) as an example
Administer ARC3 survey and publish results	Title IX Office Student Affairs Campus Life Services Human Resource Services	11/1/2019	3/1/2020	ARC3 Survey Instrument (no cost) Analysis of survey responses (existing personnel)	Obtain an accurate and robust understanding of the culture at UMB using a research- based instrument specific to sexual misconduct, including sexual harassment.	UMB is required to provide survey results to MHEC biannually regarding sexual discrimination, harassment, and misconduct. This survey could be used as part of that requirement. (For information regarding ARC3 please visit: https://campusclimate.gsu.edu/)

RECOMMENDTION 4							
Increase awareness of UMB processes, trainings, and resources for members of the community impacted by sexual harassment.							
ACTION STEP DESCRIPTIONS	PARTY / DEPT RESPONSIBLE	START DATE	DATE DUE	RESOURCES REQUIRED	DESIRED OUTCOME	NOTES	
Communication Plan & Awareness Campaign for Title IX, including issue of sexual harassment	Office of Accountability and Compliance Office of Communications	10/22/2019	Ongoing	\$5,000	Campus wide communication regarding Title IX issues throughout the year Increase awareness	Funding request is to cover the costs of collateral, design work and implementation of multiple campaigns, including posters, informatics, brochures, and cards	
Awareness campaign for UMB Hotline (revised)	Office of Accountability and Compliance Office of Communications	10/22/2019	Ongoing	\$3,000	Increased awareness of UMB Hotline and confidence that reported incidents will receive a response	Funding request is to create collateral designed specifically for increasing awareness of UMB Hotline, including posters, informatics, brochures, and cards	
Targeted live trainings and workshops offered on topics including sexual harassment, bystander intervention, and other issues based on the unique needs and interests of UMB stakeholders	Office of Accountability and Compliance	2/1/2020	Ongoing	Up to \$25,000/year	Communicate prevention strategies and promote common understanding through education and training that is offered through diverse modes, increasing audience reach and interest	<ul> <li>While OAC would be responsible, the sessions and offerings would be developed and offered collaboratively with the Schools and UMB groups to increase stakeholder buy in and effectiveness.</li> <li>Funding request is to purchase curricula and instructional support materials for live trainings that are responsive to the training recommendations of the Taskforce and included in the Campus SaVe Act</li> </ul>	

#### Budget

The included recommendations were formed with an understanding of the limitations on

monies for any solution.

For example, the following activities can occur without any additional funding:

- Policy Creation and Updates
- Website Changes to Increase Transparency
- ARC3 Survey

The following budget is offered for the independent research, and can be used in forming

grant asks that are recommended herein.

	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Human Capital			
Compliance Specialists	\$150,000	\$150,000	\$150,000
(2 FTE@ \$75,000)			
Title IX Coordinator	\$150,000	\$150,000	\$150,000
Sub Total	\$300,000	\$300,000	\$300,000
Education			
Advocate Training	\$7,000	-0-	-0-
Live Training and Workshops	\$25,000	\$20,000	\$20,000
Sub Total	\$32,000	\$20,000	\$20,000
Communications			
Title IX Awareness	\$5,000	\$3,000	\$3,000
UMB Hotline	\$3,000	\$3,000	\$3,000
Sub Total	\$8,000	\$6,000	\$6,000
TOTAL	\$340,000	\$326,000	\$326,000

## VII. Summary & Conclusion

The President's Taskforce on Sexual Harassment provided its recommendations, along with a discussion of the process and findings, to President Perman on October 3, 2019. The Taskforce acknowledged that additional work would be needed to foster the cooperation and collaboration necessary for more integrated processes and responses between UMB and the University of Maryland Medical Center. With the announcement of a new CEO for UMMC, continuing conversations are recommended.

Several members of the Taskforce have also been appointed to the President's standing Council on Women, which it was recommended have ongoing oversight of the actions and recommendations of the Taskforce. A number of the Actions included herein have been initiated under the guidance of the Taskforce. There is an anticipation that, while some actions will be ongoing, full implementation will be achieved by July, 2020.

The Chairs thank the members of the Taskforce for their ongoing dedication and hard work to address this important issue both quickly and effectively.